

Minutes of a meeting of the WEST AREA PLANNING COMMITTEE on Tuesday 24 January 2017

www.oxford.gov.uk



Committee members:

Councillor Upton (Chair)

Councillor Cook

Councillor Fooks

Councillor Pegg

Councillor Tanner

Councillor Landell Mills (Vice-Chair)

Councillor Curran

Councillor Hollingsworth

Councillor Price

Officers:

Michael Morgan, Lawyer

Adrian Arnold, Development Management Service Manager

Robert Fowler, Planning Team Leader

Andrew Murdoch, Planning Team Leader

Catherine Phythian, Committee Services Officer

Apologies:

There were no apologies for absence.

88. Declarations of interest

There were no declarations of interest.

89. 16/02687/FUL: 265 - 279 Iffley Road And Garages, Percy Street, Oxford, OX4 4AH

The Committee considered an application for the re-development of the application site to provide student accommodation (117 student rooms), 11 x self-contained flats, a single storey garden room accommodating flexible space for use as student common room/teaching/lecturing space, 150sqm GIA for employment uses (Use Class B1), and associated landscaping and infrastructure (Amended plans) at 265-279 Iffley Road and Garages, Percy Street, OX4 4AH.

The Planning Officer presented the report and highlighted the following points:

- the Oxford Design Review Panel had commented favourably on the development
- the development had been the subject of extensive public consultation and had adopted a number of suggestions from the local community

Lucy Clarke (Friends of Iffley Road), Peter McQuitty (local resident), Sarah Wild (local resident), Thelma Martin (Iffley Fields Residents Association) and County Councillor David Williams spoke against the application. Ian Thompson (for the applicant) and Simon Fraser (architects) spoke in support of the application.

The consideration of this application was filmed by ISIS Student Magazine.

In discussion the Committee noted the following points:

- The applicant (Wadham College) had confirmed that it would make a contribution in the sum of £66K as requested by the Highways Authority towards a Controlled Parking Zone (CPZ) for the area north of Iffley Road
- The County Council had earmarked a further £200k in its budget for a separate Controlled Parking Zone (CPZ) for the Iffley Fields area
- The introduction of Controlled Parking Zones (CPZ) would be covered under CIL arrangements and were not material considerations for the planning application before the Committee
- The creation of a gated access lane to the rear of the site between Charles Street and Percy Street for delivery traffic was to be commended
- The development provided much needed student accommodation in an appropriate location and would be a sensitive and sympathetic improvement to the existing street scene

In reaching their decision, the Committee considered the officers report, presentation and the address of the public speakers.

On being put to the vote the Committee agreed with the officer recommendation.

The Committee resolved to **approve** planning permission for the reasons set out in the report and subject to the following conditions and informatives and the satisfactory completion of the following legal agreements and to delegate authority to the Head of Planning and Regulatory Services to issue the permission.

Conditions

1. Development begun within time limit
2. Develop in accordance with approved plans
3. Sample materials and panels
4. Large-scale drawings of design details
5. Student accommodation, out of term use
6. Student Management Plan
7. Bin and cycle storage
8. Revised travel plan
9. Travel Information Pack

10. Student - no cars
11. Car parking spaces
12. Construction Traffic Management Plan
13. Fire hydrants
14. Landscape plan
15. Landscaping carried out by completion
16. Tree Protection Plan
17. Arboricultural Method Statement
18. Removal of trees - Percy St garage site
19. Details of boilers and CHP
20. Boundary treatments
21. Sustainable design and energy efficiency
22. Biodiversity enhancements
23. Noise levels - air conditioning, plant
24. Kitchen extraction equipment
25. Demolition strategy and validation plan
26. Phased risk assessment - land quality
27. Remedial works and validation report
28. Watching brief unexpected contamination
29. B1 office use
30. Surface water - SUDS details
31. SUDS maintenance plan
32. Drainage infrastructure details

Legal agreements

1. Section 106 agreement to secure affordable housing contribution of £643,432.72
2. £1240 fee for Travel Plan monitoring
3. £2500 for the removal of parking zones on Iffley Road via Traffic Regulation Order

Informatives:

1. Construction Traffic Management Plan (Condition 12) to be discussed with residents and in place before commencement of works.
2. That Oxfordshire County Council should be asked to expedite the completion of the Section 278 Agreement and implementation of a Controlled Parking Zone to the north of Iffley Road as a matter of priority.

90. 16/01909/FUL: Linton Lodge Hotel, 11-13 Linton Road, OX2 6UJ

The Committee considered an application for the erection of a part one and half storey, part two and half storey rear extension to provide an additional 22 bedrooms; replacement windows to east and west elevations of existing rear three storey wing; replacement windows and alterations to roof and facade materials of existing rear single storey wing; replacement of front lobby extension, including formation of roofs to existing bay windows; replacement of windows; replacement of 3No. dormer windows and alterations to facade materials; and alterations to existing car parking and landscaping with provision of bin and cycle store at Linton Lodge Hotel, 11-13 Linton Road, OX2 6UJ.

The Planning Officer presented the report and briefed the Committee on the detail of the proposed plans. He apologised to the Committee for the errors in the original report which had been corrected and the omission of the floor plans from the original presentation which had also been corrected. He informed the Committee that he recommended the inclusion of a further condition (14) to require obscure glazing and non-opening windows below 1.7m from floor level.

Anthony Crean spoke against the application. Caroline Wilberforce (agent) spoke in support of the application.

The Committee consideration of the application focused on the potential impact of the re-development on the local area with regard to traffic and parking and in particular its relationship to the character and heritage of the North Oxford Victorian Suburb Conservation Area.

In reaching their decision, the Committee considered the officers report, presentation and the address of the public speakers.

Notwithstanding the officer recommendation for approval and on being put to the vote, the Committee resolved to **refuse** planning permission for application 16/01909/FUL for the following reasons:

The proposal fails to meet the locational criteria of development plan policy TA4 not being located within any of the areas identified by that policy.

Further it would cause harm to the character and appearance of the North Oxford Conservation Area (in particular the treatment of the new entrance and the impact of the rear extension upon the existing sunken garden) contrary to development plan policy HE7 this harm being accorded considerable weight and attention as required by section 72 of the Town and Country Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 and paragraphs 131 and 132 of the NPPF, the Council further being of the view that such harm (albeit less than substantial within the meaning of the NPPF) is not outweighed by public benefits of the proposal as advised by paragraph 134 of the NPPF or clearly and convincingly justified as required by paragraph 132 of the NPPF.

That same harm also results in contravention of development plan policies CP1, CP6, CP8 and CS18.

These conclusions lead to the overall conclusion that the proposal is contrary to the development plan and other material considerations do not indicate that permission should nevertheless be granted the principal other material consideration being the combined effect of paragraphs 131, 132 and 134 of the NPPF.

91. 16/03030/VAR: 376 Banbury Road, Oxford OX2 7PW

The Committee considered an application for the variation of condition 2 (Approved plans) of planning permission 14/03445/FUL at 376 Banbury Road, Oxford OX2 7PW

The Planning Officer presented the report.

On being put to the vote the Committee agreed with the officer recommendation.

The Committee resolved to **approve** planning permission for the reasons set out in the report and subject to the following conditions and legal agreement:

Conditions

1. Approved plans
2. Materials as approved
3. Boundary treatment
4. Lighting
5. Obscure glazing to north facing windows
6. Landscape plan carry out after completion
7. Landscape management plan
8. Landscape hard surfaces
9. Tree protection
10. Arboricultural method statement
11. Top soil retention
12. Parking spaces
13. Cycle parking
14. Variation of Road Traffic Order
15. Travel plan
16. Students no cars
17. Full time students
18. Supervision of students
19. Use as boarding school only
20. Contamination - risk assessment
21. Construction management plan

22. Ground resurfacing - SUDS compliant
23. Piling methods
24. Mechanical plant
25. Extraction equipment
26. Noise attenuation
27. Drainage strategy

92. 16/03094/VAR: The King's Centre Osney Mead Oxford OX2 0ES

The Committee considered an application for the variation of condition 3 (named 'Start and finish times of ancillary uses) to remove the personal permission to 'Oxfordshire Community Churches and its associated organisations', the primary users of the site within use class D1(h) at the King's Centre, Osney Mead, Oxford, OX2 0ES.

The Planning Officer presented the report.

On being put to the vote the Committee agreed with the officer recommendation.

The Committee resolved to **approve** planning permission for the reasons set out in the report and subject to the following conditions.

Conditions

1. Specified drawings
2. Restricted uses
3. Start & finish times for ancillary uses
4. Travel Plan
5. Car parking
6. Cycle parking

93. 16/02894/FUL: 4 North Parade Avenue, Oxford, OX2 6LX

The Committee considered an application for the part change of use of ground floor and first floor from restaurant (Use Class A3) to form 1 x 2-bed flat at ground floor and an additional 1 x 1-bed flat at first floor (Use Class C3); alterations to windows and doors; provision of private amenity space and bin store at 4 North Parade Avenue Oxford OX2 6LX.

The Planning Officer presented the report.

Chris Williams and Marianne Moxon spoke against the application. There were no registered speakers in support of the application.

In discussion the Committee expressed concerns about the potential loss, or reduction in scale, of a restaurant service offering was out of keeping and detrimental to the

character of the local area. In the absence of more detailed information on the proposed Class A3 use and guidance on what would be a reasonable test of commercial viability for the development the Committee concluded that they had insufficient information before them to determine the application.

The Committee resolved to **defer** the application pending submission of more detailed information on the proposed Class A3 use and guidance on what would be a reasonable test of commercial viability for the development.

94. 16/01827/FUL: 17 St Margaret's Road, Oxford, OX2 6RU

The Committee considered an application for the demolition of an existing rear and side extension; erection of a single storey rear extension with formation of patio at lower ground floor, and two storey side extension at ground floor (amended plans) at 17 St Margaret's Road, Oxford, OX2 6RU.

The Planning Officer presented the report. And explained that the application had been called-in by Councillor Wade on the grounds that the proposed two storey side extension would fail to preserve or enhance the special character of the conservation area by eroding the spacing between properties.

Christopher and Julia Wigg spoke against the application. Ben Turney and Catherine Atkinson spoke in support of the application.

In discussion the Committee noted that the Council's Conservation Officer was satisfied with the amended plans. The Committee also considered that the existing garage to the side of the property meant that the view through the gap between the properties had already been partially obscured.

On being put to the vote the Committee agreed with the officer recommendation.

The Committee resolved to **approve** planning permission for the reasons set out in the report and subject to the following conditions:

Conditions

1. Development begun within time limit
2. Develop in accordance with approved plans
3. Materials - matching
4. Surface water drainage

95. 16/02424/FUL: 23 Thorncliffe Road, Oxford, OX2 7BA

The Committee considered an application for a basement extension, a rear ground floor extension and small first floor extension and loft conversion and insertion of a dormer window and detached building in garden at 23 Thorncliffe Road, Oxford, OX2 7BA.

The Planning Officer presented the report and explained that the application had been called-in by Councillor Fooks on the grounds of overdevelopment of the site and impact on the neighbouring property.

Norman Davis spoke against the application. Andrew Hudson and Cecilia Gorenflos spoke in support of the application.

The Committee acknowledged the issues raised by the neighbours and local residents about the impact of construction work and traffic but noted that it would be unreasonable to condition a construction traffic management plan on this scale of development. The Committee also noted that the other concerns raised by the neighbours would be correctly addressed through the Party Wall etc. Act 1996 and were not material to the planning application before them.

On being put to the vote the Committee agreed with the officer recommendation.

The Committee resolved to **approve** planning permission for the reasons set out in the report and subject to the following conditions:

Conditions

1. Development begun within time limit
2. Develop in accordance with approved plans
3. Extension materials
4. Outbuilding and dormer materials

Councillor Tanner left the meeting at the end of this item.

96. 16/02377/FUL: 134 Wytham Street, Oxford, OX1 4TW

The Committee considered an application for the erection of a single storey side and front extension at 134 Wytham Street, Oxford, OX1 4TW.

On being put to the vote the Committee agreed with the officer recommendation.

The Committee resolved to **approve** planning permission for the reasons set out in the report and subject to the following conditions.

Conditions

1. Development begun within time limit
2. Develop in accordance with approved plans
3. Sustainable Drainage Measures
4. Materials - matching
5. Plan of Car Parking Provision

97. Minutes

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes of the meeting held on 13 December 2016 as a true and accurate record.

98. Forthcoming applications

The Committee noted the list of forthcoming applications.

99. Dates of future meetings

The Committee noted the dates of future meetings.

The meeting started at 6.00 pm and ended at 8.50 pm

This page is intentionally left blank